

Truth be told...it's my job and I'm told to do it': Teachers' Perspectives on Supporting Young people from black and minority ethnic groups in Glasgow Schools onto Positive Destinations.

Nighet Riaz

University of the West of Scotland

ABSTRACT

This paper presents a qualitative case study which explores the perceptions of teachers who are responsible for students on the cusp of leaving compulsory education, and in particular, students who have been identified as having the propensity to fall out of education, employment and training. With a disproportionate percentage of young people identified as needing additional support coming from the Black and Minority Ethnic group (BME), this research looks at teachers' perceptions of the nature of support which can be offered.

Bourdieu's theoretical framework of habitus, field and capital is used to explore findings from semi-structured interviews with teachers. Key themes were identified from the interview data to better understand policy and practice. Findings suggest that policy interventions are outcome based, while school is an environment where the teachers are constrained by dominant practices. However, what is evident is the lack of BME teachers' voices, which would have added to the study.

KEYWORDS: *policy, young people, disaffection, teachers, ethnicity, schools*

INTRODUCTION

This paper sets out to examine teachers' narratives of policy and practice, where Bourdieu's framework of habitus, field and capital was critical to enhance understanding of 'the ways in which the curriculum, both overt and hidden, along with pedagogies, and their implicit taken-for-granted capitals, contribute to both the reproduction of inequality and its legitimation...' (Murphy and Costa, 2015:1).

The Bourdieuan concepts of field, habitus and capital were used to show a space for both individual and structural influences (Reay, 1998; Connolly, 1998; Rollock, 2007). I used the concept of habitus throughout the literature and the formation of the research question to explain the subjective nature of identity construction, as well as institutional and societal values and norms (fields) to situate the research participants. Institutional habitus becomes explicit when the research participants discuss the implementation of the aims and objectives of youth policies. The

narratives captured in this study illuminate the constraining effects of dominant practices in schools.

CONTEXT OF THE STUDY

In a research review commissioned by the Scottish Office Education and Industry Department seeking to provide information about education and Black and Minority Ethnic (BME) groups in Scotland, Powney et al (1998) state that Glasgow City Council had been collecting statistics on ethnic minority primary and secondary school children and young people since 1989. Pupils were classified by their ethnic background first, and then by the other languages spoken. This information has been utilised over the years where schools with high BME populations are able to monitor the ethnic composition of the school, uptake of subject choices and pupil performance. As the diverse ethnic student population has increased across Glasgow, ethnic minority teachers make up less than 1% of the teaching workforce in Scotland.

In a study looking at the post compulsory destinations of young people leaving school, Baird and Collins (2010) highlighted that out of a cohort of 65,000 young people in school across Glasgow, those destined not to go onto positive destinations included 14.8% as belonging to BME (black and minority ethnic) groups, 12.9% had English as an additional language and 3.3% had refugee or asylum seeker status.

The *More Choices, More Chances* (Scottish Government, 2006) strategy is put into practice when the young people are in the last six months of compulsory secondary education, ensuring that they are assigned guidance support either through an activity coach or careers guidance to help them plan a positive destination upon leaving compulsory education. The local council education where the study was conducted had developed a risk matrix tool which uses specific circumstances/ barriers that young people may face as an indicator of their 'risk' of entering a 'not in education, employment or training' (NEET) destination, including leaving school with few or no qualifications. This provides the opportunity for schools to clarify the potential level of need of individual pupils at an earlier stage; and to identify and offer targeted support (McEwan, 2013).

This paper is set out to examine more closely the perspectives of teachers who are responsible for BME young people, who are deemed as disadvantaged and requiring additional support, as in more choices, more chances (MCMC), by schools and agencies.

The paper starts with exploring the literature on the need for a more intersectional approach to enable a more nuanced understanding of the young person who has been identified as requiring support, and how this can impact on their transition as they move out of compulsory education. It then summarises the key drivers in Scottish education policy focusing on the processes through which young people are identified as needing support. The article then progresses by offering a reading of relevant literature through the lenses of Bourdieu's theory of habitus and social capital to uncover the key dimensions of disadvantage and exclusion. Finally, findings will illuminate some of the barriers and tensions experienced by teachers.

INTERSECTIONALITY

Certain groups of BME young people such as African Caribbean, Pakistani and Bangladeshi, have been identified as having a higher propensity to fall out of education, employment or training across the UK (Field, 2003; Hayward et al 2008; Smeaton et al, 2010), in Scotland (Netto et al, 2011) and in Glasgow (Baird and Collins, 2010). Glasgow was chosen as the site for this research as it has the highest Black and Minority Ethnic population (14%), in Scotland. With the introduction of children and young people policies to close the attainment gap and improve post compulsory education choices, it is interesting that the identified ethnic minority group is still being cited as 'at risk' (Conrad, 2005) and 'disaffected' by schools and agencies in both research and policy literature (Field, 2003; Hayward et al, 2008; Smeaton et al, 2010; Baird and Collins, 2010; Netto et al, 2011).

Modood (2004) suggests ethnic groups such as Chinese and Indian, go onto perform better at schools than Afro-Caribbean, Pakistani and Bangladeshi young people, where the same level of disadvantages persist such as poverty, social class, yet the Chinese and Indian young people are able to choose a route into higher education. However, there is evidence that ethnic groups for example Bangladeshi, African Caribbean, and Pakistani heritage are performing more poorly in comparison to their peers in schools, where their socio-economic background is suggested as one of a set of complex indicators to lower educational attainment (Shah 2008; Smeaton et al 2010; Netto et al, 2011; Deuchar and Graham, 2013). Osler and Starkey (2005:196) go further to state that the BME young people are not given the same opportunities as the main student population and are categorised as 'disaffected' and 'often poorly served by their schools' which adds to evidence that they may not have access to the same pathways as the majority student population. Lucas and Good (2001) suggest that this placement is not only un-meritocratic, but placed along social mobility/social class and along racial lines (Callahan 2005).

This lack of understanding of the impact of a young person's cultural background, homogenisation and the categorising of young people's identities and social ties, can lead to the intersectional nature of young people's disadvantage being lost (Anthias, 2001; Noble 2009; Shah, Dwyer and Modood 2010; Harris 2013; Hopkins 2013; Miller et al, 2015). The cultural identification and social positioning cannot be conducted separately from the issues of social class, gender and age, where the social inequality is constructed by the 'interplay of ethnicity, class, gender, and religion within specific space/time dimensions' (Shah, Dwyer and Modood, 2010;1110). This in turn affects the transitions of the young person as they journey through and out of compulsory education.

TRANSITIONS

Caulfield et al (2005) explore both the BME and white ethnic young people's transition from primary to secondary school, focusing on ethnicity and culture, and they concluded that disaffection within the school begins early if inequalities are not perceived to have been dealt with in the best possible way, and there is perceived to be a preference for one group of pupils over another. Teachers were seen by young people to have a key role dealing with racist incidents but were also

often described as ineffective in doing so (Caulfield et al, 2005). In some cases, this can lead to disengagement from school, the educational attainment process, and difficulty in transitioning out of compulsory education onto a positive destination (Demack et al 2000; Caulfield et al 2005; Riaz 2014; Miller et al 2015). Cassidy et al (2006) also state that there is increasing recognition among practitioners and policymakers of Black and Minority Ethnic (BME) young people being particularly vulnerable in transition from compulsory education to the outside world, where there is a lack of data about the experiences of BME young people, and the necessity of more research 'if interventions are to be sensitive to differences between young people from BME and White backgrounds but also between young people from different minority ethnic groups' (ibid:3). Yet, despite the detailed information collected by the Local Authorities and other governmental bodies, there is limited understanding of the cultural identity and needs of the BME young people who are characterised as disengaged and disaffected by policies such as More Choices, More Chances (2006). Therefore it would follow that education policy recognises the importance of transitions from entry into the compulsory education to exiting the compulsory education system as vulnerable stages of development for young people 'to strengthen future needs planning arrangements for those young people with additional support needs, who need extra help, to ensure a successful transition to post-school life' (Scottish Executive 2005a:42).

THE SCOTTISH POLICY CONTEXT

The Scottish Government has constructed young people falling into the NEET category as both an economic and social dilemma (Finlay et al, 2010). To decrease the number of young people as 'NEET', the government has developed policy themes which have evolved to encompass a more inclusive pedagogy, through inclusion, equality and citizenship and interagency working in every local authority across Scotland to support young people to transition onto positive destinations (Opportunities for All, 2012, Scottish Government). More Choices, More Chances (2006) strategy, is the government's policy to encourage local authorities and other partners to undertake a comprehensive range of measures to ensure that the post-16 system centres on supporting those at risk of disengaging and those who have already become disengaged.

The government recognises that the national policy provides a broad framework but does not specify how the service is to be delivered to the individual young person who needs support. This has been highlighted by Arshad et al (2007:130) when examining policy documents where the lack of specificity and the need for a more focused approach for diverse learners is lost through the broad terms of this policy. The responsibility for making comprehensive decisions about service delivery based on policy rests with local authorities and increasingly, rests with front line professionals because they are seen to be best positioned to decide how to achieve outcomes in specific local settings. However, in schools, the front line professionals are teachers, and they have to address complex situations according to their work environment and their job remits. The next section goes onto discuss how social capital has been understood and used in policy making in the education sector.

SOCIAL CAPITAL IN POLICY MAKING

Social capital has commonly been studied in recent years from the perspective of sociology and political science. Through the writings of Bourdieu (1983; 1991), Coleman (1988; 1990; 1994), Putnam (1994; 2000) and Fukuyama (1995; 1999), the social capital construct has evolved rapidly into a multifaceted account of people's relationships and their values. Having achieved considerable, even worldwide prominence, it has been adopted as a positive element in the creation and maintenance of economic prosperity (Fukuyama, 1995; 1999), and democratic governance (Putnam, 1993; 2000). In this case study, social capital is explored in different forms from policy formulated around young people, to how it is seen to transform young people's lives through their networks through evidence-based research. Fukuyama (1999:7) states that

'the area where governments probably have the greatest direct ability to generate social capital is education. Educational institutions do not simply transit human capital; they also pass on social capital in the form of social rules and norms.'

This quote indicates the power that governments have through policy and strategy implementation to generate social capital into not only economic capital, but as actions and behaviours which are acceptable to society. For those who are not aware of the majority society's rules and norms, a deficit is already created.

This adds to the research by Reay (1998) and Hopkins (2013) who discuss institutional habitus, such as a school or a youth work organisation as a complex blend 'of agency and structure and could be understood as the impact of a cultural group or social class on an individual's behaviour as it is mediated through an organisation' (McDonough, 1996).

This suggests that schools are sites of continuous movement of young people through their school lives, from year to year, where the school plays an important role in shaping the views and experiences of the young people, from entering to exiting the school (Bhopal and Myers, 2008). Institutional habitus have a history and have been established over time similar to that of an individual habitus. For example, Reay (1998a, b) has argued that schools have identifiable habitus and has used the concept to demonstrate how the organisational cultures of schools are linked to wider socio-economic cultures through schools and their catchment areas (which is the designated geographical area around the school where the pupil resides) mutually shaping and reshaping each other. Although there are fixed physical boundaries to denote one field, the agency of other fields such as social policy and the flow of constant cultural capital from different groups of young people from across the world entering the school as students, enables the schools to become more flexible as they are shaped by the 'complex webs of local, national and global influences and different social and cultural flows and processes' (Hopkins, 2013, p11). Through examining the cultural backgrounds of the identified young people, the school can also be perceived as having a habitus or identity of its own. This 'institutional habitus' is seen as both subjective and relational as it can refer respectively to the way things are done, the social sphere within which action takes place and capital is accumulated within the school (Reay, 1998, a, b).

Davies (2013) in contrast talks of

‘Formal institutions’ such as schools and ‘peer networks, families and neighbourhoods’ might sometimes impede this ‘navigation’ to ‘positive life outcomes’. Davies (2013, p16)

The observation made by Davies (2013) points to the perpetuation of disadvantaged which is transferred at the collective level: some institutions, families and networks may be sites added where agency may not occur. Thus social capital may not be generated or transformed into bridging or linking capital to support the transition for the young person onto a positive destination (Bassani, 2007). This could be further seen as control, and channelling of the young person into a particular direction by institutions, parents, etc, which they may or may not wish to partake in, as it is not their understanding of a direction that they may wish to travel. By comparison, Weller and Bruegal (2009) take a more subtle and context sensitive approach to the social capital aspect and the role it plays in creating social capital within social networks in which the young person interacts. Similarly, Cousse et al (2009) found young people from backgrounds such as those impacted by ethnicity, poverty, social class, disability and gender were less able to accredit and utilise social and cultural capital. This is explained by Arshad et al (2007) as related to the lack of specific positive action in addressing these inequalities at the structural level, within schools and institutions. This leads us to explore the broader context of social disadvantage by using Bourdieu’s framework of Habitus, Field and Capital to situate the research study, before moving onto explore the impact of intersectionality and transitions which shape the directions the young people choose as they prepare to leave school.

BOURDIEU’S FRAMEWORK FOR UNDERSTANDING IDENTITY FROM A SOCIOLOGICAL PERSPECTIVE

Bourdieu’s Theory of Practice (1980) was adopted as the theoretical framework which was underpinned by both a constructionist and an interpretivist stance. This framework consists of habitus, field and capital, and it is the interaction of habitus and field which produces capital, which then goes onto produce practice as a result of the capital. In this paper, this set of transitions would refer to the policy being implemented in schools, and the result would be the outcome of BME young people who were identified by policy as requiring additional support towards a positive destination, then going or not going onto further or higher education, employment or training.

Murphy (2013: xxiii) sees the malleability of Bourdieu’s concepts to form analytical and methodological frameworks through the application of one or more concepts to explore and understand social phenomena. Bourdieu (1980) states that,

‘the theory of practice as practice insists that the objects of knowledge are constructed, not passively recorded, and, contrary to intellectualist idealism, that the principle of this construction is the system of structured, structuring dispositions, the habitus, which is constituted in practice and is always oriented toward practical functions.’ (1980:277)

Drawing on Bourdieu's theory of habitus and social fields (1990), identity results from the process by which individuals internalise elements of the social world during their social interactions within different social fields. Bourdieu's argument is that an individual's dispositions are produced and 'reproduced in relation to the social, economic and cultural structures on which agents operate and with which they identify themselves or detach themselves from' (Murphy and Costa, 2015:5). These elements are then interpreted by individuals and externalised back into the social world in the form of subjective beliefs, tastes, practices and values, which, in this section, are regarded as the main indicators to understand identity.

'social identity is defined and asserted through difference' (Bourdieu, 1984:172)

It is argued that the education system plays a role in reproducing such differences. I use this concept as a point of departure for framing this inquiry into how the teachers identify, perceive and support the BME young people who fall into the policy category of requiring additional support.

This highlights the requisite for further research to better understand the cultural backgrounds of BME young people, so that schools, agencies and national and local governments can tailor interventions that can bring in more effective policy and practice outcomes, and a successful transition for the individual young person.

This led to a gap in literature and the formation of the research question of how do teachers perceive BME MCMC Young People?

This paper is an opportunity to explore how school staff perceive the BME MCMC young people using a case study approach and Bourdieu's Theory of Practice (1977).

METHODOLOGY

A qualitative case study methodology was adopted to explore the research question, to portray the issues under review in its personal and social complexity (Stake, 1988:256), whereas Lewis and Ritchie (2003:51-52) note the importance of gaining multiple perspectives from multiple data collection methods.

The study took place in 3 secondary schools in Glasgow which have high minority ethnic student populations. Semi-structured interviews were utilised as a data collection method (Fielding, 1995; Mason, 2002; Patton, 2002). The names of the schools and research participants were assigned pseudonyms to remove markers of identification.

Five teachers across 3 secondary schools were interviewed. Howard is the Employability and Enterprise Officer at Brookes Secondary School. Robert is the Principal teacher of pastoral care and Mike is the Head of Employability at Hawthorne High. In Mandela High School, Gordon and Alan, both principal teachers were interviewed. The research participants are responsible for the young people as they transition out of compulsory education, in particular young people who require additional support during the transition period (last six months of compulsory education) as designated by the MCMC (2006) strategy. The teachers were Scottish White, aged between 40 to 60 years old and male.

Directed content analysis (Hsieh and Shannon, 2005:1282) was used to analyse the data using the research question and the interview schedule as the

template, where using line by line coding and dispositions are highlighted in the transcripts. The dispositions (Bourdieu, 1990) from the data analysis are grouped together where they have a commonality, and are linked to the research question and the literature.

The themes were derived from the analysis of the literature using Bourdieu's theory, which led to the research questions and informed the themes which emerged from the data: Networks; support, trust and rapport; resource capital; linguistic capital; non-attendance. All sub-themes were then grouped under a main theme: 'The Building of Support, Trust and Rapport' and the findings are discussed in detail in the following section. The theme of building support, trust and rapport is the main focus of this paper in order to explore the perceptions of the teachers of BME young people. However, policy (in)effectiveness and positive destinations will also be discussed.

THE BUILDING OF SUPPORT, TRUST AND RAPPORT

Alan shares his opinions through a narrative of his teaching experience, over the last two decades. He states that a young person's background can affect the educational outcome. Using this awareness, he feels a solution could be found to help the young person progress at school.

'I could recognise that for all pupils, your home circumstances, the kind of almost mental attitude of your parents have a huge... and your family network have a huge bearing and so I wanted to be more aware of that and be able to influence that in some way....to help young people learning and progress in school.' Alan, Principal Teacher (Mandela High)

He focuses on the parents, family and home environment of the young person as an indicator for the young person's ability to learn and progress at school.

'...Every day... you never know what challenges are going to be there and you're never an expert in any situation really. But you do build up an experience that allows you to give it more confidence – just the principles and the things that you value, that you bring to bear in each. 'Alan, Principal Teacher (Mandela High)

Alan discusses strategies and solutions for the young people with the information he has, extrapolating and filling in the gaps by pulling on past experiences to understand the More Choices More Chances (MCMC) young people cohort from ethnic backgrounds better. According to Bourdieu's Theory of Practice, Alan is continuously using reflexive accounts of previous experiences and knowledge from himself (habitus) and the different contexts and environments, policy demands (fields) in which he needed to operate, and where the habitus created change to enable Alan to adapt to the new scenario presented to him.

Gordon shares the importance of having strategies in place and being aware of the backgrounds of identified young people.

'I think having post strategies in place are important... Very often it's not their fault, it's because of their family background. So if the family don't support them, and they have no one else to support them, somebody has to support them. I certainly welcome the fact that we have these strategies in place.' Gordon, Principal Teacher (Mandela High)

Gordon identifies the lack of support from the young person's family or other networks, which can result in a history of non-attendance, where the young person chooses to hang out in the streets rather than at home or at school. He sees the strategies as moving the responsibility for the young person to the schools and agencies to help them attend school.

'I think it's difficult at times, sometimes they don't want to engage with the support that's being offered, because they even find that difficult. They've gotten into the swing of not attending school or the role models that they have at home or in the community don't work therefore they aspire to hang about the streets.' Gordon, Principal Teacher (Mandela High)

He continues to say it is a challenge to engage with the young people, but he believes that strategies are still needed to show that support is available. According to Bourdieu, Gordon's account is where there is structure and agency, but where the young people 'resist power' in this particular context (Moncrieffe and Eyben, 2013:37).

The next two sections share two of the findings which are discussed by the teachers as barriers a young person may have to face. The first being the availability of support to assist the young people, and secondly the lack of support for the teachers and the young people to be taught English to reduce the communication barrier.

SUPPORTING YOUNG PEOPLE BY BUILDING TRUST AND LANGUAGE PROFICIENCY

Alan, (Mandela High) talks about the frustration he feels in dealing with the sometimes very difficult situations he finds himself in as he tries to deal with pupils who need extra help as they come from different and unknown backgrounds and cultural differences.

'Progress is being made... its building... It's difficult but it is building. Another local thing that we have Slovakian outreach workers based in the school,... our home link workers, so they have been a huge influence, and not just in MCMC, but just in terms of having interpreters and interpretations available and just good contact between the school...' Alan, Principal Teacher (Mandela High)

The availability of having interpreters to help assist the teachers, young people and their families to develop dialogue and understanding of the school and also of the school to understand the incoming student's culture is welcomed by Alan. There is acknowledgement within the school structure of exploring avenues to create social capital by creating links between the school and the families of the young people (Reay, 1998; Hopkins, 2013).

Bourdieu and Passeron (1977) suggest that this disparity between the language spoken in the home and the language of the main community and in school is an important factor which can lead to educational failure, whereas Collins (1993) talks of this as the 'linguistic deficit'. Warin (2015) discusses this as an opportunity to research this focus on language as it is embedded in social and emotional relational ties between families and teachers in schools to better understand the

generation of social capital to reproduce social advantage or disadvantage (ibid:44). Fukuyama (1999:7) states that schools transmit not only human capital but social capital as well. If a young person is unaware of society's values and norms due to a linguistic deficit, they are already at a disadvantage.

'We also have a number of youngsters arriving now with little or no English, because there is no.... there used to be a bi-lingual support unit at [School x] where youngsters, where it was felt it could help support – although they were enrolled here at [(Hawthorne)], they would spend a few months at the bi lingual support unit and then would be gradually put in classes in [School x], and then come back here. That no longer exists, so we have a wee boy at the moment who just arrived, a Chinese boy who speaks no English, who has been put into a secondary mainstream. Robert, Principal Teacher (Hawthorne)

The teachers recognise the importance of the bi-lingual support unit to ensure the building up of linguistic capital to enable a smoother transition of newly arrived young people into mainstream education, and that the closure will impact on the students 'keeping pace academically, learning a new language and integrating cultural values' (Lee, 2014:5). The lack of integration could lead to the young person's attendance record being affected.

(Non) Attendance

Mike in (Hawthorne) speaks about the issue of non-attendance of which is a primary issue in the MCMC cohort. He discusses the protocols put in place in the school to ensure that the young people go onto 'positive destinations' of higher or further education, employment or training.

'When I came here 4 years ago, one of the issues we had was non-attenders – is what we called them, pupils who came enrolled and then we never really seen them again, so then it became negative destinations at the end of the school time. I think we've got a grip where we know where everyone is now. We can go out...we have been working hard that everybody has the opportunity to go onto a positive destination, that we don't have any NEET/MCMC but we are still going to have them.' Mike, Principal Teacher (Hawthorne)

'...thinking of one pupil ... she just won't be in – her non-attendance is a big issue. Her staying at home and not going out and about. We've tried a number of strategies – we're still working with this young person... has been a lot of home visiting, there have been meetings in school, with her parents and her family. We've reduced her timetable to give her some time. For a bit of last year she was coming in on Wednesday morning to do a bit of basic maths and English. So there have been a number of different strategies there...' Alan, Principal Teacher (Mandela High)

Non-attendance by students is mentioned by Alan, Gordon and Mike, as a prime indicator of concern on the matrix. There has been significant research carried out around truancy over the decades, with different approaches being utilised.

In the following quote, Alan, discusses the different backgrounds of young people identified as requiring interventions as coming from different social strata. He states that when Slovakian students return to their school in Glasgow, they lag behind other students, due to missing large parts of the formal schooling. This

inadvertently leads to gaps in their education due to the long periods of absence from school.

‘...we may look at some of our pupils from Slovakian background...who we see a change in – as they go up the school, perhaps their attendance is poorer, so that has been a – and their educational backgrounds in their home country has not been complete. They’ve maybe come and gotten started primary school later on in Glasgow...’ Alan, Principal Teacher (Mandela High)

Robert, (Hawthorne) also discusses the backgrounds of the young people, particularly those who are classed as ‘pre-NEETS/MCMC’.

‘Some of the possible NEET, are the looked-after youngsters, they could be looked after at home, so it’s a bit like they could have been referred to a children’s panel for non-attendance, for a whole range of things, ...offending in the community, ... the victim of something whether its domestic abuse. We have a group of young people – particularly in this school, ...who are looked after away from home...unaccompanied young people who have arrived in this country and who are in contact with Barnados, Hamilton Park, were many of them are young males, ...’ Robert, Principal Teacher, (Hawthorne)

Robert highlights a diverse range of factors, not just ethnicity but issues related to socio-economic, gender and family context which are taken into account in the building up of the young person’s profile used in the matrix system database. This leads onto the next theme which discusses the support provided to the school to deal with the diverse range of factors the young people face.

Supporting Each Other

Alan discusses the changing demographics in the schools and the local communities over the years, and the conversations with longer serving members of staff helps him understand that this situation has happened before and is not uncommon.

‘...Shona [Deputy Head Teacher] is very good to talk to about this. She has been in the school and lived in the area for a long time. I think when some of us were tearing our hair out over the newer incomers, the Eastern European pupils and so on, very poor language skills, or very basic language skills, very basic general knowledge, even little educational background before they’d come to Glasgow. We were tearing our hair out and Shona was reminding us as we were saying ‘where is this going?’, we were in a situation, where we were not really developing these young people, but Shona was reminding us that actually going back 20/30 years, this was the same situation for the Pakistani/Kashmiri communities that settled in Glasgow. ’ Alan, Principal Teacher (Mandela High)

Alan talks in relation to new incoming communities such as the Slovaks and the Roma, against the comparator of Pakistanis and Kashmiris who arrived a few decades previous, and in terms of making progress. He argues that having the expertise and knowledge of senior, long serving staff members that have been in

similar situations, helps them work together to find solutions, in the changing ethnic student make up and diversity of the school. This sharing of knowledge illustrated between Shona and Alan indicates a culture of communication, trust and respect in another's knowledge and expertise to help move forward to deal with current issues. This is an example where a supportive environment assists individuals at different times of their professional careers because it gives them the help both emotionally and practically that enables them to survive (Nias, 1998; Guarino, Santibanez and Daley, 2006). This support, Leahy (2012) believes, is needed throughout a teacher's career to help them manage the complexities of the personal and professional life. Woods and Weasmer (2002) state that collegiality enhances job satisfaction for teachers and Nias (1998) was surprised to find that supportive relationships become even more important in the later stages of a teacher's career. Nias (1998) suggests it is their wish to make a mark or to influence others in a positive, professional manner. In this case, it was the sharing of past experiences with new incoming students, enabled the teachers to use and tailor strategies for the new student cohort.

School culture in this section refers to the beliefs, values, behaviours, attitudes and relationships that exist within the schools. It reflects the views of Nias, 1998; and Guarino, Santibanez and Daley, 2006, that a reciprocal environment in the school assisted staff members at different times of their professional careers because it helps them survive both emotionally and practically. The teachers in this research identify a school culture that was supportive of colleagues working together with each other and external agencies for a better outcome for their students. School culture is perceived as a 'habitus' in itself which inculcates a set of beliefs, values and norms, with a distinct identity, reproducing a specific set of behaviours and a particular culture. This institutional habitus would consist of a multifaceted mix of agency and structure and be examined as to the impact of a cultural group as it is facilitated through an organisation such as a school (McDonough, 1996). However, there is no mention by Alan of guidelines that teachers can use when dealing with difficult situations with incoming students from different nations, rather, relying on historical anecdotes from longer serving members of staff for guidance. No mention is made of reciprocal relationships with a BME member of staff or consulting outside organisations towards understanding the needs of the new ethnic minority students entering the school population.

Reduction of Support Staff to Support Students

Robert discusses the support needs of the students and the dramatic change and growth of agencies tackling these complex issues within the school.

'Having them is good, we have 2 [counsellors] and that's going to increase to 3 counsellors coming into the school at different times during the week. One is a specific project for schools, [X] counsellor, one coming in from [Y] Family Network, so that helps us... We have [Y] Family Network, who work with families, we have the SDS service, Skills Development Scotland, there is such a wide range now...'Robert, Principal Teacher (Hawthorne)

Robert sees this as policy makers 'out there' recognising and acknowledging the complex lives of young people and the additional pressures they are facing, by bringing support into the schools. He recognises that he is not an expert when

dealing with the more complex issues, which is why having specialist agencies is the way forward to support the more vulnerable students.

'So there is more influence *out there* about targeting youngsters earlier to make sure they don't end up, as [Mike] says, mopping up the mess at the end, it's about preventing that mess from happening...' Robert, Principal Teacher (Hawthorne)

Robert agrees with Mike, that earlier interventions and support for the children at the point of entry into the secondary school system to deal with the indicators highlighted by the risk matrix, rather than when the young people are on the point of leaving compulsory education.

'It does feel at the moment, I think it sounds like, but it does like it at the moment that we are dealing with pupils as they come up to that leaving point...' Alan, Principal Teacher (Mandela High)

Alan then adds that the procedure seems to become more apparent/visible as the young person is about to leave school, where he feels it is too little, too late, which is also highlighted by Gordon.

'...for example, we could only refer to an activity agreement coach, if the pupil is coming up to statutory leaving age. If we miss that window, or if the pupil decides to stay on in school, then it doesn't work out, we've missed that window. That pupil will lack that one to one input in the community and it runs a greater risk of not having the same level of support that they would have gotten if they had decided to leave at the earlier date.' Gordon, Principal Teacher (Mandela High)

There is a general consensus across all the schools that the six month window to place a young person leaving compulsory education is not wide enough, and interventions are needed earlier in the young person's school history to ensure that a destination is agreed with the young person.

The teachers in my study have to contend with an increasing work load on top of their other duties, where colleagues have left and not been replaced, and the work load is shifted onto the remaining staff members.

When asked why teaching staff had taken on additional pastoral care roles, there were varied answers.

'...truth be told, - because it's my job and I'm told to do it' Gordon, Principal Teacher (Mandela High)

'There were 29 of us in Glasgow, progress meant that the 29 went down to 13 and is now down to 10 across the city. I have a senior school in [school 1], [school 2] and [school 3], that's larger than most secondary schools in Scotland.' Howard, Employability Support Officer, (Brookes)

'There are 4 Principal teachers of pastoral care. To give you an indication of when I first started, there was an amalgamation of 2 other schools, we had 1100 pupils and we had 10 pastoral care teachers. We now have about 900 pupils and we have 4 pastoral care teachers. So our remit has increased over the number of youngsters we look after. So that has its own... Trying to do all the other remits, as well as I said I do,

one of the remits I do is the UCAS applications. So there's 50 odd kids applying to university between now and Christmas, it's a big job organising predicting grades, references, getting them all together and sent away.' Robert, Principal Teacher (Hawthorne)

There appears to be constraints posed by the curricula and resource shortage which impacts on both the quality and quantity of time they can give to the young people. In a school environment, where there are large numbers of students assigned to the school staff members, the building of support, trust and rapport becomes difficult, and the emphasis is shifted onto ensuring a transition takes place where the school fulfils its remit to the state.

CONCLUDING DISCUSSION

Drawing on the theoretical lens of Bourdieu's habitus, field and capital, in the structuring and framing of the research questions, I sought to understand the reality experienced by teachers involved in supporting young people from Black and Minority Ethnic groups through compulsory education. Habitus is used to explore both the research participant and the organisation, where the fields are the contexts within which the habitus operates, i.e. policies, rules, regulations, timetables, curricula, exam results, the risk matrix and school leaver destinations, schools and other agencies.

Non-attendance by students is a key finding in this study. In particular, cultural differences can impact on educational attainment, and indeed engagement within the school and their peers can lead to a young person falling further off the grid. This is due to fractured and incomplete schooling as discussed by Alexander et al (2015:5) and highlighted in the UK-wide results of the lowest achieving pupil groups. Reportedly, these are Travellers, Gypsies and Roma people, with 17.5% of Irish Travellers and 10.8% Gypsy or Roma students achieving 5 or more GCSEs including English and Maths.

Examples of this labelling can be found where the matrix system is used to highlight the pupil who will have the highest propensity to fall out of education, employment or training.

According to the teachers in this small scale study, the BME MCMC young person will be

- An ethnic minority: Pakistani; Kashmiri; African; East European; Middle East
- Disadvantaged background- location identified as being high on the Scottish Indicator of Multiple Deprivation; chaotic home-life (no cohesive structure or routine); drug and alcohol issues; on the fringes or falling into criminality; falling behind peers in school.
- Communication Issues – poor linguistic skills; attitude or behavioural issues; non-attendance

The teachers recognised the importance of the bi-lingual support unit, a Bourdieuan field of cultural reproduction of the education system which ensured the building up of linguistic capital and enabled a smoother transition into mainstream education. The unit helped to ensure that young people were given the skills and knowledge to help them familiarise themselves with the school culture and form a sense of belonging which is inscribed in both teachers' minds and young people of the social order, and where the young people learn the space they

go onto inhabit in society and school. This is the space where the young people were categorised as to their place in society and school by both institutions and society (Bourdieu, 1986). Its closure had relevance to the delivery of day to day teaching practice, the young person's sense of belonging, policy and educational attainment according to the teachers.

The teachers in Hawthorne and Mandela schools lamented the closure of a bilingual unit where the lack of linguistic capital will impact on new arrival students 'keeping pace academically, learning a new language and integrating cultural values'. According to Lee (2014), these features of support are central to ensuring cultural acceptance in the mainstream student cohort, and may compensate for the deficit in social capital leading to wider gaps in trying to meet societal values and norms (Fukuyama, 1999:7).

The importance of re-opening the bilingual needs unit cannot be re-emphasised to ensure the gap between the young people doing well and not so well doesn't become wider due to poor linguistic capital. This is relevant as the current Scottish Government has committed to welcome more refugees and their families over the following 5 to 10 years.

The teachers from all 3 schools speak about the small timeframe, 6 months before the end of compulsory education for young people labelled as red on the matrix, as part of the policy intervention, giving them access to an activity coach. If the young person does not take advantage of the offer of support, then the opportunity is lost as they move forward. The teachers see the policy intervention as too little too late (Alan) and mopping up the mess at the end (Robert) by teachers who perceive themselves as already very thinly spread (Gordon) through their job remit.

The schools and teachers in this study interpret and implement policies such as More Choices, More Chances (2006), as almost functional and in a business-like manner where procedures need to be followed to arrive at the desired or allocated outcome with other agencies input as the young person is exiting compulsory education, to ensure they are seen to comply with policy requirements; that the process is transparent and all 'boxes are ticked'; and trying to fit it in with all the other parts of their responsibilities. The key findings focus on the lack of resources, such as budget constraints, leading to the reduction of school and agency staff to support young people through their school journey and transition onto a post-compulsory pathway. There is acknowledgement that young people enter the school with complex issues where staff members do not have the skillsets to support the more complex behavioural support needs of the young people.

The school staff are responsible for reporting back outcomes to school management, and there is a real concern for resources in an economically constrained climate, employment posts for more staff to assist current staff, and curriculum time (Ball et al, 2012:8). Each school takes a different approach with the resources they have, to enact the policy, through different layers of interpretation from policy makers, local government, school management and the resources available. Ball et al (2012:8) say that 'the onus is on the schools to 'make' sense of policy where (sometimes) none is self-evident.' Although Ball et al (2012) in their study on English schools, discuss that schools may only partially implement a policy in order to incorporate it into school documentation for

accountability and audit, rather than to implement change as policy requires, I did not find evidence of this in my study.

Black and minority ethnic and female teachers or school staff are missing from this study, as the research participants were Scottish White, in the age range of 40-60 years old and male, and further research with a more diverse range of participants can add to this study. The lack of forward planning and investment by the Scottish Government and local government in a more diverse workforce in the school space to promote identity and belonging of BME young people is evident as the current workforce is below 1%.

In times of budget constraints, resources are reduced or removed and these are services which impact upon the most marginalised young people on the periphery of society and therefore education. The closure of the bi-lingual unit impacts by increasing the workload of teachers, and creating unfavourable conditions where a newly arrived young person does not understand the host language and cannot communicate with their teachers or peers, and further exacerbates the deficit discourse around the young people.

Although a small scale study, the discourse is very much one of 'assimilation' into the mainstream culture, and the reproduction of the Scottish culture through the bi-lingual unit and how schools operate in Scotland. There is a top down power relationship, where indicators are used to inscribe a young person their place in the school system through the matrix, without engaging with young people directly. A reason for this could be time constraints in an already busy teaching schedule. Worryingly, practices seen as inclusionary may alienate young people in school spaces due to them not feeling they belong through the categorisation of their place in the school system.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to thank Professor Christina Forde and Dr. Laura Colucci-Gray for their support and feedback in helping me develop my criticality in writing this article.

REFERENCES

- Alexander, C., Weekes-Bernard, D. and Arday, J. (2015) *The Runnymede School Report: Race, Education and Inequality in Contemporary Britain*, Runnymede Perspectives, Runnymede, London
- Arshad, R., Catts, R., & Forbes, J. (2007) The role of social capital in Scottish education policy. *Scottish Educational Review* Vol.39 (2), 127-137.
- Baird, M. and Collins, M. (2010) 16+ *Learning Choices in Glasgow*. [online] <https://slideplayer.com/slide/783580/> [accessed 29 August 2018]
- Ball, S. J., Maguire, M., & Braun, A. (2012) How schools do policy. *Policy Enactment in Secondary Schools*. Abingdon, Oxon: Routledge.
- Bourdieu, P. (1977). *Outline of a Theory of Practice* (Vol. 16), Cambridge University Press.
- Bourdieu, P. and Jean-Claude Passeron (1977) *Reproduction in Education, Society, and Culture*, Trans.
- Bourdieu, P. (1979) (translated by Richard Nice) *Distinction* (London, Routledge and Kegan Paul).
- Bourdieu, P. (1983) *The Forms of Capital* Originally published as "Ökonomisches Kapital, kulturelles Kapital, soziales Kapital." in *Soziale Ungleichheiten* (Soziale Welt, Sonderheft 2), edited by Reinhard Kreckel (Goettingen, Otto Schartz & Co).
- Bourdieu, P. (1985) The social space and the genesis of groups. *Theory and Society* Vol.14 (6), 723-744.
- Bourdieu, P. (1986) 'Forms of Capital', in J. Richardson (ed.), *Handbook of Theory and Research for Sociology of Education* New York: Greenwood

- Bourdieu, P. (1990) *The logic of practice*. Stanford University Press.
- Bourdieu, P., and J. Passeron. (1990) *Reproduction in education, society and culture*. Trans. R. Nice. London: Sage.
- Bourdieu, P., and Thompson, J., B. (1991) *Language and symbolic power*. Harvard University Press.
- Callahan, R. M. (2005). Tracking and high school English learners: Limiting opportunity to learn. *American Educational Research Journal* Vol.42(2), 305-328.
- Cassidy, C., O'Connor, R. and Dorrer, N. (2006) *Young people's experiences of transition to adulthood A study of minority ethnic and white young people*. York: JRF.
- Caulfield, C., Hill, M., and Shelton, A. (2005). *The experiences of black and minority ethnic young people following the transition to secondary school*. Scottish Council for Research in Education.
- Coleman, J. S. (1988) Social capital in the creation of human capital. *American Journal of Sociology* Vol.94, 95–120.
- Coleman, J., S. (1990) *Foundations of social theory*. Cambridge, MA: The Belknap Press.
- Collins, J. (1993) Determination and contradiction: An appreciation and critique of the work of Pierre Bourdieu on language and education. *Bourdieu: critical perspectives*, 116-138.
- Connolly, P. (1998) *Racism, gender identities and young children: Social relations in a multi-ethnic, inner-city primary school*. London: Routledge.
- Demack, S., Drew, D., and Grimsley, M. (2000) Minding the Gap: Ethnic, gender and social class differences in attainment at 16, 1988–95. *Race, Ethnicity and Education* Vol.3(2), 117–143.
- Deuchar, R., & Graham, L., J. (2012) On school disaffection in 'new times': hard-nosed policies, inflexible institutions and bruised young people. *International Journal on School Disaffection* Vol.9 (1), 3-5
- Field, J. (2003) *Social Capital*, Routledge, London
- Fielding, N., G. (1995) Qualitative Interviewing in Gilbert, N. (ed) *Researching Social Life*, London: Sage
- Finlay, I., Sheridan, J., McKay, J., and Nudzor, H. (2010) Young people on the margins: in need of more choices and more chances in twenty-first century Scotland *British Educational Research Journal* Vol.36(5), 851-867.
- Fukuyama, F. (1995) Social capital and the global economy: A redrawn map of the world. *Foreign affairs* Vol.74 (5), 89-103.
- Fukuyama, F. (1999) *The great disruption: Human nature and the reconstitution of social order*. The Free Press.
- Guarino, C. M., Santibañez, L., and Daley, G. A. (2006) Teacher recruitment and retention: a review of the recent empirical literature. *Review of Educational Research* Vol.76, 173-208.
- Hayward, G., Wilde, S., & Williams, R. (2008) *Rathbone/Nuffield Review Engaging Youth Enquiry*. www.nuffield14-19review.org.uk (accessed 14 April 2012)
- Hopkins, P. E. (2013) *Young people, place and identity*. Routledge
- Hsieh, H. F., & Shannon, S. E. (2005) Three approaches to qualitative content analysis. *Qualitative health research* Vol.15 (9), 1277-1288.
- Leahy, C. (2012). Teacher evaluator training: Ensuring quality classroom observers. Denver, CO: *Education Commission of the States*. Retrieved from www.ecs.org/clearinghouse/01/01/14/10114.pdf, [accessed online 11 October 2014].
- Lee, Y. J. J. (2014). Rethinking the Curriculum: Meeting the Needs of Immigrant Students in Multiculturalism. *SFU Educational Review* Vol.1 (1), 1-11.
- Lewis, J., and Ritchie, J. (2003) Generalising from qualitative research. *Qualitative research practice: A guide for social science students and researchers*, 263-286.
- McDonough, P. (1996) *Choosing Colleges: How Social Class and Schools Structure Opportunity* (New York: SUNY Press).
- McEwan, S. (2013) BME student population classed as needing interventions to help re-engage back into education, employment or training, *Freedom of Information Act Request*, https://www.whatdotheyknow.com/request/bme_student_population_classed_a#incoming-401042.
- Mason, J. (2002) *Qualitative Research*, 2nd edition, Sage Publications
- Miller, J., McAuliffe, L., Riaz, N., & Deuchar, R. (2015) Exploring youths' perceptions of the hidden practice of youth work in increasing social capital with young people considered NEET in Scotland, *Journal of Youth Studies* Vol.18 (4): 468-484.
- Moncrieffe, J., and Eyben, R. (2013) *The power of labelling*. Earthscan.

- Munn, P., and Lloyd, G. (2005) Exclusion and excluded pupils. *British Educational Research Journal* Vol.31 (2), 205-221.
- Murphy, M. (2013) Between power and knowledge: using social theory in education research. In: Murphy, M. (ed.) *Social Theory and Education Research*. Series: SAGE library of educational thought and practice. SAGE: London, UK.
- Murphy, M., & Costa, C. (Eds.). (2015) *Theory as Method in Research: On Bourdieu, social theory and education* Routledge.
- Netto, G., Sosenko, F., and Bramley, G. (2011) *A review of poverty and ethnicity in Scotland*. Joseph Rowntree Foundation.
[http://wsmp.org.uk/documents/wsmp/Migration%20\(general\)%20research%20and%20reports/poverty-ethnicity-Scotland-summary.pdf](http://wsmp.org.uk/documents/wsmp/Migration%20(general)%20research%20and%20reports/poverty-ethnicity-Scotland-summary.pdf)
- Nias, J., 1998. Why teachers need their colleagues: A developmental perspective. In *International handbook of educational change*. 1257-1271. Springer, Dordrecht.
- Osler, A., and Starkey, H. (2005) *Changing citizenship*, McGraw-Hill Education (UK).
- Patton, M.Q. (2002), *Qualitative Evaluation and Research Methods*, 3rd ed., Sage, Newbury Park, CA.
- Putnam, R. (1994) Tuning In, Turning Out: The Strange Disappearance of Social Capital in America, *American Political Science Association Online*, [Online] Available at: <http://www.apsanet.org/ps/dec95/putfig2.cfm>
- Putnam, R. (2000) *Bowling alone: The collapse and revival of American community*. New York: Simon Schuster.
- Reay, D. (1998) Rethinking social class: Qualitative perspectives on gender and social class *Sociology* Vol.32 (2), 259-275.
- Riaz, N. (2014) 'Ethnicity, young people and 'othering.' 'It's like we don't exist': transitions from school to nowhere', in P. Cunningham & N. Fretwell (eds.) *Innovative Practice and Research Trends in Identity, Citizenship and Education*. London: CiCe, 370 – 383.
- Rollock, N. (2007) Legitimizing Black academic failure: deconstructing staff discourses on academic success, appearance and behaviour. *International Studies in Sociology of Education*, 17(3), 275-287.
- Scottish Executive (2005a) *Health for All Children 4: Guidance in Implementation in Scotland*, Edinburgh, Scottish Executive.
- Shah, S. (2008) Leading multi-ethnic schools: adjustments in concepts and practices for engaging with diversity. *British Journal of Sociology of Education* Vol.29 (5), 523-536.
- Shah, B., Dwyer, C. and Modood, T. (2010) Explaining educational achievement and career aspirations among young British Pakistanis: mobilizing 'ethnic capital'? *Sociology* Vol. 44(6), 1109-1127.
- Smeaton, D., Hudson, M., Radu, D., and Vowden, K. (2010) *The EHRC Triennial Review Developing the Employment Evidence Base*, Policy Studies Institute
http://www.equalityhumanrights.com/uploaded_files/triennial_review/triennial_review_employment_evidence_base.pdf (accessed 10 April 2018).
- The Scottish Government (2006) *More Choices, More Chances: A strategy to reduce the proportion of young people not in education, employment or training in Scotland*.
<http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Publications/2006/06/13100205/0> [accessed 22 November 2017]
- Woods, A. M., and Weasmer, J. (2002) Maintaining job satisfaction: Engaging professionals as active participants. *The Clearing House* Vol.75 (4), 186-189.